

Test Code: 21081

FIAS - 2019 - GS10D

RECEIVED

31 AUG 2019

ForumIAS

ACADEMY

ForumIAS  
MGP0019581

GENERAL STUDIES

Name Of Candidate	Dnyanshu Singh			
Email Id.	[REDACTED]		Roll No.	1910049593
Mobile No.	[REDACTED]		Date:	31/08/2019

Time Allowed: Three Hours

Maximum Marks: 250

INDEX TABLE			INSTRUCTION	
Q. No.	Max. Marks	Marks Obtained	<p>1. Please do furnish Name, Email, Roll No and Mobile in the answer sheet.</p> <p>2. There are TWELVE questions printed in ENGLISH, all questions are compulsory.</p> <p>3. The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.</p> <p>4. Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided.</p> <p>5. Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to. Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum Answer Booklet must be clearly Struck off.</p> <p><i>Any specific messages for ForumIAS Mentors/ Evaluators with respect to your copy? Write it here.</i></p> <p><i>Should I limit my word-length to 120-130 in case I find it in 10-markers to improve attempts?!</i></p>	
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
Total Marks:				
Remarks:			Start Time   3:30 PM	End Time   6:40 PM
			Mode Of Examination :	Online <input type="checkbox"/> Offline <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
			ECN CODE:	Evaluation Date:

<b>Parameters</b>	<b>Excellent</b>	<b>Very Good</b>	<b>Good</b>	<b>Average</b>	<b>Poor</b>	<b>Very Poor</b>
Language						
Structure						
Presentation						
Handwriting						
Content						
Attempt						

ADDITIONAL COMMENTS

## PART - A

Q.1) a) What do you understand by "good" in good governance? Is good governance always ethical governance? Analyse. (10 Marks, 150 Words)

Governance refers to the system or set of activities to ~~ensure~~ administer the resources of a state for ~~the~~ ensuring public good.

The good emphasises that this ~~pro~~ <sup>administration</sup> must not be for sole management of people as a means but rather for their own benefit treating them as an end.

<u>Good governance</u> vs	<u>Governance</u>
Welfare state	Police state
& citizens	Subjects
Basic rights	No / little rights
Interest of citizens supreme	Interest of State supreme
People (the governed) decide objectives	Rulers (those who govern) decide objectives.



## Good governance is ethical

- (i) It promotes individual and collective interest. (utilitarian)
- (ii) Kantian approach (people as an end)
- (iii) Respect of rights.

## It may not be always ethical:

- (i) Majoritarian will may take precedence over minority interests.
- (ii) Welfare of some may be harmful to others.
- (iii) Social morality may precede individual morality.

However, with constant scrutiny, good governance may be aligned with ethical governance.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		<b>Total :</b>	





b) What is constructive confrontation? Can there be progress without confrontation? Discuss the importance of Civil service values in resolving the same.

(10 Marks, 150 Words)

constructive confrontation refers to a situation of disagreement where the other person's viewpoints are also respected.

Eg. Parliamentary debates/discussions.

Importance of Confrontation for Progress:

- (i) In legislation, confrontation allows better evolution of laws.
- (ii) In policy making, it opens up space for feedback & criticism, allowing improvements.
- (iii) Prevents society from stagnation.
- (iv) ~~Move ahead with new ideas~~

Thinkers / philosophers like Socrates, Plato, Gallileo's works were at confrontation with accepted social norms. But, they

benefitted society by bringing it out of conservatism & dogmas.

~~Civil service values~~ However, even without may not be absolutely essential for progress as there are certain widely accepted norms. eg. morality, widening of human rights etc.

Civil service values & their role in handling confrontation:

Impartiality: allowing all views equal value

Neutrality: ensures absence of prejudice

Compassion: positive attitude towards others' disagreement.

In conclusion, we can say that confrontations are an integral part of society. They must be respected.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	



Q.2) a) "Self-restraint is the very keystone of the ethics of vow-taking." What do you understand by this statement in the present-day scenario? Explain. (10 Marks, 150 Words)

Self-restraint means keeping a check on one's own activities. It ensures bodily desires & yearn for immediate gratification do not take precedence over long-term interests.

Vow-taking can be understood in broad sense as committing oneself to a particular norm of behaviour for personal, social or moral interest.

Importance in Present day Scenario:

(i) Tolerance : Mutual co-existence necessitates view of tolerance. when hate speech & mob lynchings are rising, self-restraint would help us see larger picture.

(ii) Environment : ~~is~~ with worsening



climate change, a way to reduce one's carbon footprint can be implemented by self-restraint on using fossil fuels, harmful practices, meat-based diets.

(iii) Hunger: Prevention of food wastage can feed 40% more people. ~~Now~~ Self-restraint in use of food can help way of ending hunger.

Therefore, at ~~the~~ centre of execution of a way, lies concept of self-restraint.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	



b) "To become a man of integrity, being honest towards yourself is the very beginning."  
What do you understand by this statement? Explain your stand with illustrations from your personal life. (10 Marks, 150 Words)

Integrity is steadfast adherence to righteous conduct over time. It requires an individual to do the right thing even when the situation would be rewarding for choosing the opposite.

Why be honest towards yourself?  
(for integrity)

- (i) If you lie to yourself, you would lie to others as well.
- (ii) Internal locus of control
- (iii) It means one doesn't seek external sanctions for one's actions  $\Rightarrow$  More likely to show integrity.

Therefore, the statement means that ~~when~~ if one is unable to ~~not~~ uphold right

conduct in private, he will only do what external actors would like to see him doing.

## Personal Examples

- (i) As school headboy, I ensured that I followed all rules strictly to imbibe integrity in myself
- (ii) Keeping promises made to myself to strengthen my resolve for ~~right~~ <sup>righteousness</sup>

Therefore, just like knowing oneself is beginning of all wisdom, honesty towards one self is beginning of integrity towards others.

### Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	





**Q.3) a) Discuss the Public Services Management Code as recommended by the 2nd Administrative Reforms Commission.**  
**(10 Marks, 150 Words)**

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		<b>Total :</b>	



b) Discuss the ethical dimensions of international aid with examples.

(10 Marks, 150 Words)

International aid is assistance by a national or supranational entity for another state.

Eg. India's goenka programme in Rwanda, Africa.

### Ethical dimensions :

#### (i) International morality

Equality Treatment of fellow states with compassion not transactional mindset.

#### (ii) Humanism

Equality of all humans as members of one race not as citizens of a nation.

#### (iii) Issue of equality

It may hamper a state's prestige if the donor's manner is not appropriate



(iv). Quid-pro-Quo Basis

States like China helping other nations to expand ambit of their Belt & Road Initiative.

Eg. Its help to ~~add~~ Pakistan is being seen as neo-colonialism.

In international relations, ~~now~~ self-interest is said to be sole-guiding phenomenon.

However, ethical perspective can make them more humane & the world a better place by introducing decency.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		<b>Total :</b>	



Q.4) a) The fundamental question in Public services is "Who will guard the guardians?". Analyze in the context of accountability of civil servants for good governance.

(10 Marks, 150 Words)

The question emphasises the role of checks & balances in an administration to ensure that the authorities do not turn dictatorial-

### Importance of Civil Servants' Accountability

- (i) Ensures responsiveness to public.
- (ii) Ensures public welfare
- (iii) Good governance requires administration to work as per people's will. Therefore, bureaucracy must be ~~held~~ held accountable.
- (iv) Provides an external agent of control.

Who will guard the guardians!

The statement can be read in light of

accountability as emphasising importance of values, ethics & morality in ~~ensuring~~ civil services.

Values like transparency, neutrality, integrity, compassion etc. ensures that bureaucrats are ~~continues~~ continuously aware of their ~~respons~~ responsibilities towards the public. These act like a guard over these guardians because they hold them ~~accountable~~ accountable to their own conscience even in absence of external supervision.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		<b>Total :</b>	





b) Explain the importance of political neutrality for civil servants. Discuss in light of increased political alignment shown by bureaucrats. (10 Marks, 150 Words)

Political Neutrality implies that bureaucrats would use their expertise to help the political executive of the day in best possible manner without any ideological predisposition.

### Importance of Political Neutrality:

- (i) It ensures that bureaucracy give their best in implementary executives' decisions.
- (ii) Eases decision making in case personal wisdom conflicts with public mandate
- (iii) Prevents politicisation of administration
- (iv) Essential to respect public will.

In recent times, it has been seen that bureaucrats try to be in good books of

ministers for personal career progression. This is harmful not only for neutrality and non-partisanship but also for public-orientalism of services as bureaucracy becomes reluctant to change.

This also affects their functioning. Therefore, such alignment should be resisted. However, some amount of commitment must be reflected by bureaucrats towards programs to ensure their success despite changing regimes.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	



Q.5) a) "Moderation in temper is always a virtue; but moderation in principle is always a vice." - Thomas Paine - What do you understand by the statement? Explain giving examples.

(10 Marks, 150 Words)

The statement is similar to what Albert Einstein had said:

"Relativity applies to physics not to Ethics".

The statement by Paine emphasises that there cannot be an over-ethical personal as adherence to ethics is always good.

Why moderation in temper is virtue?

- (i) Prevents emotional actions taken in fit of rage - Eg. destruction of objects in anger.
- (ii) Allows good thinking to prevail. And after some-time, short-tempered actions are regretted. Eg. An attack by a person on another in anger.



## Why moderation in ethics is a vice?

- (i) It makes us adhere to moral selective & convenience-based, defying their purpose.
- (ii) Righteousness should be inhibited always especially in difficult times
- (iii) There can't be different rules for different situations.

Eg - A judge pardoning his son for a crime just because he's his son.

only when going gets tough, it does the tough get going. Likewise, only in difficult circumstances, upholding ethics requires effort. Allowing moderation would defy the purpose.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		<b>Total :</b>	



b) Ethical dilemmas arising in private and government institutions one and the same. Do you agree with this view? If not, enumerate the differences and mention the approaches in resolving both the dilemmas. (10 Marks, 150 Words)

Though ethical dilemmas may arise in multiple settings, their type usually differs.

## Ethical dilemmas in ~~not~~ private sector

- Profit vs. Legal vs Ethical.
- Sustainability vs short-term interest
- Safety/ security of consumers vs. Minimisation of cost  
eg. car company.
- Reduce profit margins to raise affordability vs. Improve profit margins to raise sustainability.

## Ethical dilemmas in govt sector

↳ what is public interest?



- ↳ Personal benefit vs societal benefit.
- ↳ Bureaucratic neutrality vs.
  - ↳ Public-orientedness etc.

Sp In private sector, the primary concern is profitability & sustainability. However, sometimes this can come in conflict with public morality. It can be resolved by realising that deceiving customers is harmful in long run therefore public morality.

In government sector public interest must be placed foremost followed by commitment to public well. Bureaucratic neutrality helps in resolving such issues.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		<b>Total :</b>	





Q.6) a) Discuss the contribution of Immanuel Kant to the field of ethics. What are the limitations to his approach? (10 Marks, 150 Words)

Immanuel Kant ~~popu~~ popularised the deontological approach to ethics.

He emphasised importance of means and said that they can not be sacrificed even w for noble ends.

### Contributions of Kant

- (i) Deontological Approach
- (ii) Balanced the utilitarian approach
- (iii) Showed intrinsic worth of each individual
- (iv) Added compassion to a mere cost-benefit analysis.
- (v) Helped resolve dilemmas in difficult circumstances:  
Eg. arguing against torture even for public welfare

## Limitations :

- (i) over-emphasis on means may compromise ends.
- (ii) we have to make a choice. ~~with~~ so, some would benefit, some would lose. Better to minimise loss.
- (iii) ~~society may~~ Individual interest may take priority over collective interest.

However, despite limitations, Kant's contribution to ethics has been significant in providing a balance to Jeremy Bentham's utilitarianism

### Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	



b) "We can have no consideration for a machine which is meant either to enrich the few at the expense of the many, or without cause to displace the useful labour of many." In the light of this statement, discuss the ethical implications of large scale use of Artificial Intelligence. (10 Marks, 150 Words)

Artificial Intelligence has opened up multiple dimensions of possibilities and immense potential in field of science & technology. However, at the same time, it has raised concerns regarding joblessness.

### Ethical Implications of A-I.:

- (i) Displacement of human labour.
- (ii) would raise inequalities.
- (iii) Remove human touch of compassion in any activity.  
Eg. Robotic surgery.
- (iv) - Machine age. ~~loss~~ environment: value of humans will reduce
- (v) Dignity of labour would decrease.



The statement asks the reader to view humans as an end not as tools that should be replaced by machines.

### Importance of Statement

- (i) Machines must improve human race as a whole, not a few.
- (ii) Any technology should be for well-being of humans.
- (iii) Progress without equality is counter-productive.

Therefore, an ethical perspective would allow us to have more considered & nuanced view of A.I. and ~~allow~~ adapt it for our collective benefit accordingly.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	



c) What does this quotation mean to you in the present context: "A mind all logic is like a knife all blade. It makes the hand bleed that uses it." - Thirukkural. (10 Marks, 150 Words)

The statement emphasises the role of compassion in handling any situation. It means that solely relying on intellect may drive a person to take unreasonable, unethical & immoral decisions -

Relevance in present context:

(i) Law for Forced Land Acquisition

While mind would see land acquisition from pure utilitarian development perspective, compassion forces us to see humans as an end providing relief & rehabilitation.

(ii) Convicts

Reformatory justice system only a

contributive one.

### (iii). Out-throat Competition

It is driving children to suicides.  
Therefore, parents & society must be  
compassionate in handling children's  
failures.

~~Self~~-reliance on mind would make a  
human, a wild animal. It is only with  
compassion, that one can have a  
positive attitude and reasonable approach  
to a problem.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	





## PART - B

Q.7) You are the Principal of a very reputed school in the city. One day after going through the attendance report of students, you found that a student of class 7 was continuously absent for more than 20 days. After enquiring from her class teacher and friends, you got to know that she is undergoing some fast. A similar case of a girl fasting for several days leading to her death surfaced in the media reports a year back.

You are very much worried about the child. You, along with the class teacher tried to meet the parents and relatives of the child. According to her parents, the fasting was voluntary and this was not the first time she had taken up fasting. However, few neighbors allege that the fast was done for family pride and good fortune in business as their business has suffered losses.

In the above context answer the following:

- What are the ethical issues involved in this case
- Should the individual be given "right to die" or is it a social evil and hence should be rejected?
- What are the options available to you and what course of action would you take? Justify with reasons? (20 Marks, 250 Words)

(a). This case study reflects the issue of "religious freedom" vs society's obligation towards a child.

Ethical issues involved:

- Respecting individual rights vs speaking against religious dogmas
- Individual liberty vs religious freedom under Art. 25.
- Whether society or parents have legitimacy to decide best interest of a child.
- Moral priorities vs civil obligations  

[ Preventing harm to a child ]	[ Non-intervention into family sphere ]
--------------------------------	---

(b) Social evils flourish with tacit acceptance of society & religious sanctions.

Right to die is often seen as going against right to life as life is often valued as an intrinsic ~~value~~ worthy...

having

Right to die

for

against

- (i) Respecting individual choice
- (ii) Compassion for a terminally-ill person
- (iii) <sup>morally</sup> wrong to force a person to live against his/her own will.

- (i) Undermines value of human life.
- (ii) May be emotionally driven decision
- (iii) Euphemism for suicide & ~~abuse~~
- (iv) Abatement of suicide cases may go unpunished

Right to die is not per se a social evil. However, religious practices like



Santhara may be considered a glorification of suicide.

Moreover, social, parental & religious pressure implies choice may not be truly free. Thus, it may be allowed for mature individuals above a certain age but strict no for children.

(c) As a principled and social agent, I have following choices:

(i) Ignore the case

Merit	Demerit
(i) No responsibility	(i) Morally wrong.
(ii) Avoid confrontation with parents	(ii) would impact my conscience.
(iii) Civil obligation of non-entersion	(iii) In case of death, may bring bad name to school.

(ii) Call the Police

Merit	Demerit
(i) Easy option	(i) May bring bad news to school.
(ii) Responsibility shifted	(ii) May draw ire of parents.



course of action chosen:

- (i). I would first persuade the parents to call off the child's fast for her own health,
- If they're reluctant, I would try to convince them by ~~the~~ reminding of legal social consequence in case something goes wrong. I would also seek help of some social workers / NGOs.
- If they still don't agree, I would approach the district administration / police and ask them to step-in
- In any situation, it is the best interest of child that must prevail.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	

Q.8) You are an ordinary employee of a prominent firm which is launching a revolutionary product. The product incurred huge expenditure in terms of manpower, time and financial capital. As an employee of the company you were carrying out final rounds of testing just a couple of days before its launch. In the process, you found a loophole in the product, which may compromise data of consumers who will use it. Press is all geared up for the release and stocks of firm are rising in anticipation. As a part of duty you raised the issue of loophole before your boss, who asked you to remain quiet. Also, he promised that they will look into it once product is launched. Given your financial situation you are in dire need of being employed but your sense of duty is demanding some action to protect consumer privacy.

- a) Discuss the options you have in front of you along with their merits and demerits.
- b) What do you think will be the best course of action and why?
- c) Throw light on ethical concerns faced by different agencies utilising public data. (20 Marks, 250 Words)

④ This case study reflects a situation where person interests are pitted against social / moral obligations. In times of Industry 4.0, such concerns are ubiquitous and demand special attention.

I have following options:

(i) Keep quiet

Merit	Demerit
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- job saved (<u>Personal interest</u>)</li> <li>- Boss happy (<u>Career progression</u>)</li> <li>- <u>No risk</u> to me further company will solve in future</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <u>Social conscience</u> hampered.</li> <li>- Public's <u>privacy</u> violated.</li> <li>- May bring <u>bad name</u> to company, in future</li> </ul>



(11) Become a whistleblower.

Merit	Demerit
- <u>Public interest</u> upheld	- Loss of job
- <u>Moral satisfaction</u>	- further employment difficult
- Non-ethical money won't bring happiness	- precarious finances.

(b) Both above options are on extreme ends & I would ~~have~~ tread a balanced path.

Course of Action:

(i) I will first try to convince Boss that product safety must be supreme. In case issue is flagged in future, ~~a~~ product recall would cost heavily & bring bad reputation to company.

(Eg. Volkswagen's cars' environmental norms)

(ii) If he doesn't budge, I'll try and approach his senior & convey the issue to him/her.



(iii) In case this doesn't work, I'll use all formal channels to reach higher echelons of company employees/managers etc.

(iv) After exhausting all options, I would have to go for media-agents to expose these loopholes. It would be immoral and unethical to place personal interest over collective interest of millions.

Further, there's no guarantee that hiding loopholes would save my job as Boss may fire me in case leaks are reported in future to make a scapegoat.

(c) Data has become the new oil. But, the very owners/creators of data seem to have little agency over it.

It is being used by governments, organisations, corporations etc. to serve public, or private purposes but handling has raised

many concerns

Ethical concerns regarding data

- (i) Public good (for benefit of all)  
or  
Personal good (for ~~to use~~ each user only)
- (ii) Services delivery vs data privacy.
- (iii) Safety & Security (for personal interest)  
vs.  
Free flow of data (for collective use)
- (iv) Profit motives (~~corporates~~ maximum use)  
vs.  
Individual liberty (minimise intrusions)

Various agencies ~~corporates~~ must follow certain ethical standards while dealing with data of individuals as personal data is identity of a citizen and its secrecy is integral to social prestige, emotional comfort & privacy

Feedback (For OFFICE use only)

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	





**Q.9)** A recent judgement from the Supreme Court has allowed the entry of women in a prominent temple of a district. As the Superintendent of Police (SP) of the same district, you are well aware of the ground realities. Tinkering with religious beliefs may lead to communal tension and beyond. A group of women from outside the state has planned to visit the temple on a very religious day, just a few days later, to celebrate this verdict. This has caught the eye of media too. The local population is also gearing up to prevent enforcement of the verdict to preserve the age old tradition. Political parties are also harnessing the issues by flaring up emotions of the people for political benefit. In this background as a SP your experience suggest brewing turmoil at the ground level may lead to unwarranted activities in the district in the coming days.

- a) Discuss possible ethical issues that emanate from this case study.
- b) As SP of the district what possible measures will you take to handle the ground situation in a peaceful manner? (20 Marks, 250 Words)

(a) This case study is relevant in the case of judgement delivered by the Supreme Court in Indian Young Lawyers Association case for Sabarimala Temple in Kerala.

The case reflects the issues of personal interests vs collective interests of a religious group.

Ethical Issues involved:

- (i) Religious freedom of an individual vs. Religious freedom of a denomination
- (ii) Social Morality vs. Constitutional Morality
- (iii) Ensuring peace & law & order as an SP vs. Enforcing judicial verdict as an agent of state -



(iv) safety of outside visitors  
 vs.  
 Respecting local sentiments

In a deeply and multi-religious society like India, religion is a sensitive issue and demands careful handling by all organs of state.

(b) As an SP, I would have to ensure law and order and safety of all individuals.

Course of action:

- I would first ~~offer~~ issue an advisory against ~~dis~~ <sup>violent</sup> disallowing any protests or ~~prevention~~ of any obstruction into enforcement of judicial verdict.
- However, this is unlikely to help as sentiments are high. I would get in touch with local leaders and politicians and try to convince them for

following constitutional route of an appeal  
or a legal route of legislative law.

- I would also seek help of religious / spiritual gurus / priests to calm the situation. At the same time, I would appeal to general public / activists through media not to politicise the issue as that would further aggravate the crisis.
  - If this still doesn't solve the issue, I would make a ground assessment and seek additional forces and help of the chief minister to prevent any untoward incident.
  - In the end, my topmost priority would be ensuring safety and security of all citizens. With the help of <sup>forces,</sup> <sub>police</sub>
- I would try to maintain law & order

and try to facilitate visits.

- with help of district magistrate, issuing an order under section 144 of CrPc may also help.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		<b>Total :</b>	





**Q.10)** A prominent start-up owned by you is running its business quite well. With over 100 employees, it has captured a decent market share in its segment in recent times. As a part of future planning you now want to expand the business to ward of competition. For that purpose the business model requires heavy capital infusion. As the founder and astute businessman you know that, if capital is not raised immediately, the business may run out of steam in the foreseeable future, rendering you and hundreds of your employees jobless.

In this background you see an opportunity wherein an HNI (High Networth Individual) is willing to invest the exact capital you are in need of. But after interacting with the HNI you have serious doubts with regard to the origin of the money. You fear the source of the money are from illegal and immoral activities.

- a) What will you do, knowing if you refuse the money it will jeopardise employment of many people?
  - b) Is it ethically justified to donate wealth amassed by illegal means to charity and poor feeding?
- (20 Marks, 250 Words)

This case study is an example of conflict of personal material interest vs social moral obligations of upholding your conscience.

As not just mine, but fate of 100 hundred other individuals are also involved, the situation is further complicated.

Issues involved

Various options available

(i) Accept the capital

Merit	Demerit
- Sustain my startup at least for <u>medium-term</u>	- <u>Moral upheaval</u> of indirectly abetting in <u>illegal wealth</u>

- Saves employment of 100 people
- Investment in my startup would be legal.
- How How HNI got money or not my business

- Prioritising profits over ethics
- May bring bad name to my startup

## (ii) Refuse the Capital

Merit

Demerit

- ~~risk retrenchment~~
- Conscience upheld
- No association with black money, which could be potentially dangerous.

- risk retrenchment of 100 employees & closure of my loss of my hardwork

### Way forward!

- Rather than outright refusal, I would insist on disclosure of source of his funds for sake of legal & transparency concerns
- In case he ~~to~~ refuses to do so, then ~~it~~ it is almost sure that money is illegally & immorally earned & I would refuse it.



- At the same time, I would try to more proactively approach other investors who may be interested.

### Reasons:

- (i) If my business model is sustainable, I would be able to attract other investors.
- (ii) No guarantee that this capital would ensure my startup forever.
- (iii) In case poor association brings bad name in future, closure would harm even more employees.
- (iv) The concept of Robinhood ~~as~~ has historically only been seen by ~~lens of one~~ flawed single angle only. It is based on presumption that all wealth is illegally amassed, all rich are criminals & morally corrupt and all poor are virtuous.



From a teleological approach, we may compromise means for ends & thus, it may be justified.

From a deontological perspective, means are equally important and therefore, this would be unethical.

However, as Mahatma Gandhi insisted that only noble means yield noble ends, it is not ethically justified.

Moreover, illegal activities like corruption, trafficking, smuggling etc. are the reasons for poverty & inequalities in first place.

Justifying such action means we also justify these nefarious activities, indirectly ~~condoning~~ condoning criminal activities & corrupt practices.

\* Feedback (For OFFICE use only)

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	



**Q.11)** You are Mr. X, a resident of Delhi, and father of a 17 year old girl. You are also a well reputed lawyer working for the government for the last fifteen years. You are known for your integrity and uprightness. Recently, a 14 year old girl was raped in the outskirts of the city. The culprit has been arrested and is facing the wrath of the public sentiments. You have been called up by the law minister and is given the charge to defend the culprit. The members of the Bar Association have decided to boycott the culprit. Although you have been assigned the case but you too are apprehensive about the possible repercussions of defending the culprit. You are ached at heart imagining the trauma through which the minor child and her family would have gone through. As a lawyer you are also aware about your duty as a professional. In the above circumstances answer the following:

- What are the ethical dilemmas present before you in the context of the above situation?
- Identify the stakeholders and their interests.
- Whether the laws in our country is robust enough to protect the victim vis-à-vis the culprit?
- What course of action would you take? Justify with reasons?

(20 Marks, 250 Words)

Q The case study is an example of personal integrity vs. professional integrity

Should Mr. X, as a person take precedence over Mr. X, as a lawyer or vice-versa is essentially the standoff in this dilemma.

### Ethical dilemma

(i) Personal integrity vs professional integrity

(ii) Rule of Law vs social judgement

(iii) compassion for the 14 year old victim vs.

willingness to provide a fair trial for culprit.



(iv) ~~Personal~~  
Personal interest (social image)

vs.

Professional interest (be in good books of law minister)

(v) Perception of my daughter as of me as a role model, especially considering she's a minor too.

## ⑥ Various Stakeholders

<u>Stakeholder</u>	<u>Interest</u>
(i) Mr. X	Image as a <u>father &amp; lawyer</u> . carrying out <u>professional duties</u> . obliging law minister -
(ii) Culprit	fair trial   no incarceration etc.
(iii) Rape victims & her family	Justice
(iv) Society	Restoring rule of law <u>Punishing</u> the culprit. <u>Instant</u> justice



⑤ Bar Association Public Image.

⑥ Indian society & legal system seems to be ill-equipped or inadequate when it comes to prevent crimes against women. As per National Crime Record Bureau (NCRB) data, one woman is raped every 7 minute in India.

Theoretically the laws are robust enough as there are adequate provisions like

- (i) victim-friendly trial process
- (ii) witness protection scheme.
- (iii) Capital Punishment etc.

However, it is the enforcement that lacks. Moreover, due to social pressure, trial court judges are pre-disposed to grant death punishment & police eyes to complete case, thus putting accused in a disadvantageous position.

④ Rather than jumping to conclusions, I would first approach the girl & her family and listen to their side whether the police has nabbed the right person. Then, I would also hear the side of culprit and see whether he's innocent or actually guilty.

If he's guilty, I would ask him to plead guilty and ensure cooperation in securing a reasonable punishment.

If he seems innocent, I would fight his case as he must get a fair trial. It is also my professional obligation and personal responsibility to ensure that social vengeance should not punish an innocent individual.

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		Total :	





Q.12) You are posted as an ACP in NCR. In the week of Independence Day celebrations, you received an anonymous tip off that a terrorist is hiding in a dense locality in the city. In the following search operations, you and your team managed to track down the suspect in the locality. But you could not arrest the suspect due to local protests and resilience. You had no choice but to fire in the air to isolate the suspect. In the charged up situation that followed a few people died due to gunshots, including the suspect. Following this event, you were hailed across media and police circles as a hero for your courageous act. Years later, you are retired from service and a biopic is being planned, based on this event. It depicts you as the hero and the dense colony where event took place as a hotbed of illicit activities.

A few civil society members filed a petition in the court for banning its release. They argue that it can prejudice the trial. They are of the opinion that film is far away from reality. Even the posters of the film depict locals as terrorists. They approach you for your moral support.

a) Given that, you know you are the only person who can authoritatively comment on the facts of the event, will you support their cause? Explain. Also discuss the ethical issues in the case.

b) In the hindsight, when you look at that incident, how differently do you think, could you have dealt with the situation? (20 Marks, 250 Words)

The situation <sup>or incident</sup> mentioned in the case are not rare as often. social perception is seen to affect the outcome of any decision, be it of courts or police or even an individual.

The cinema and mass-media have conditioned people into thinking & behaving in a particular fashion which is often unethical, socially unhealthy & casually racist/sexist.

As in this case, I am the only person whose opinion would be considered legitimate, I would support their cause



## Why support the cause?

- (i) Apprehension of civil society members are genuine. That trial courts are predisposed towards capital punishment shows impact of social perception on justice system.
- (ii) It would permanently attach 'terrorist' tag to residents of that area for generations to come.
- (iii) Dramatisation takes away focus from real issue which is rule of law and a free & fair criminal justice system.

## Ethical Issues

- (i) Personal interest (good public image)  
vs.  
Professional integrity (free & fair trial)
- (ii) ~~Cinema~~ as a means of social transformation  
Mass Media vs.  
~~Cinema~~ as a social evil.  
Mass Media

(iii) ~~the~~ Impact of prejudices on functioning of state systems.

(b) Handling situations in Real time are very different from a post-mortem analysis of what could have been or what should have been.

However, I would contemplate on sequence of incidents to see where it went wrong, that led to death of <sup>other</sup> ~~so many~~ individuals which were likely, not guilty.

Alternate course of action:

(i) I would first see, if it's possible to avoid those protests & still arrest the accused.

(ii) In case, it's not possible, I would take along higher number of ~~soldiers~~ policemen

to prevent law and order situation without need to fire.

(ii) Emphasis ~~is~~ would be on ensuring the suspect doesn't leave but no one is injured.

The person is suspect & not yet guilty.  
It is for law courts to determine  
no guilt & or innocence →

Feedback ( For OFFICE use only )

Structure		Content	
Question Interpretation		<b>Total :</b>	



## Mentor Feedback Questions

- 1 .....
- 2 .....
- 3 .....
- 4 .....
- 5 .....

## Test Goal

- 1 .....
- 2 .....
- 3 .....

## Outcomes

- .....
- .....
- .....
- .....

## Marking Scheme

Marks	Good	Average	Below Average
10 Marker	3.75 – 5.0	3.0 – 3.5	< 3.0
15 Marker	5.75 – 7.0	4.0 – 5.5	< 4.0

\*Subject to change without prior notice.

For any suggestions and/or grievances regarding evaluation, please mail to :  
**asif@forumias.academy**

---

## IMPORTANT : We've made some changes to MGP

---

Dear Friends, We have brought some changes to you send your copies to us.

1. Upload your copies on the academy portal itself. Now you **no longer need to submit your copies by email to us**. You can login to your account and just upload your copy on your academy.forumias.com portal. Read more at <http://support.forumias.com/how-do-i-send-my-attempted-mgp-copies-to-forumias-academy/> or Google "forumias how to upload mgp copies".

2. Please compress your files. If you are going to submit copies online, and we need to quickly download them, please use a compressor like PDF compressor to ensure that you file size is within the range of 7-10MB. This will help us hasten your copies. We recommend using the free windows software. Available here : <https://www.pdfcompressor.net/>

3. Support : We have streamlines support for MGP / MGP copy Delay / Mentor Calls. You do not need to any longer send us emails for support. You can raise a ticket with respect to any issues that you are facing, and we will resolve your issue within 3 working days. You can raise a ticket at <http://academy.forumias.com/mytickets> . In case your issues are not addressed, you can email us at [student@forumias.academy](mailto:student@forumias.academy)

**\* It is advisable to raise a ticket after the copy has been evaluated**

4. You can see all the good copies of your Tests at

MGP 2019 : <http://blog.forumias.com/goodcopies2019>

MGP 2020 : <http://blog.forumias.com/goodcopies2020>

5. Help us help you by doing these (1) Use your real name when you create an account on <http://academy.forumias.com> (2) Update your real name by visiting <http://one.forumias.com> (3) Raise only one ticket for all your needs at <http://academy.forumias.com/mytickets> . Re-open old tickets even for new issues.

# ForumIAS

ForumIAS, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, IAPL House, 19, PUSA Road, Karol Bagh, New Delhi.